

## Tilburg University

### The legitimacy of highest courts' rulings

Adams, M.; Bomhoff, J.A.; Huls, N.

*Publication date:*  
2009

*Document Version*  
Other version

[Link to publication in Tilburg University Research Portal](#)

*Citation for published version (APA):*

Adams, M., Bomhoff, J. A., & Huls, N. (Eds.) (2009). *The legitimacy of highest courts' rulings: 'Judicial deliberations' and beyond*. MC Asser Press.

#### **General rights**

Copyright and moral rights for the publications made accessible in the public portal are retained by the authors and/or other copyright owners and it is a condition of accessing publications that users recognise and abide by the legal requirements associated with these rights.

- Users may download and print one copy of any publication from the public portal for the purpose of private study or research.
- You may not further distribute the material or use it for any profit-making activity or commercial gain
- You may freely distribute the URL identifying the publication in the public portal

#### **Take down policy**

If you believe that this document breaches copyright please contact us providing details, and we will remove access to the work immediately and investigate your claim.

## SUMMARY OF CONTENTS

<b>Foreword</b> by Mitchel LASSER	V
<b>Table of Contents</b>	XI
<b>List of Contributors</b>	XIX

### *Introduction*

Chapter 1 <b>Introduction: From Legitimacy to Leadership</b> Nick HULS	3
--	---

### *Part I. The Comparative Enterprise*

Chapter 2 <b>Transforming Deliberations</b> Mitchel de S.-O.-l'E. LASSER	33
Chapter 3 <b>What do we Lack?</b> Ugo MATTEI	55
Chapter 4 <b>A Socio-Legal Analysis of the Legitimacy of Highest Courts</b> Fred BRUINSMA	61
Chapter 5 <b>Comparing Judicial Reasoning on a Formalism/Policy Axis: Problematizing and Contextualizing 'Formalism' in Mitchel Lasser's <i>Judicial Deliberations</i></b> Jacco BOMHOFF	77
Chapter 6 <b>'In good faith': Re-imagining Comparative Law Discourse</b> Bram GOETSCHALCKX	91
Chapter 7 <b>Formal and Substantial Justification in Legal Decisions: Some Critical Questions from an Argumentative Perspective</b> Harm KLOOSTERHUIS	111

### *Part II. The Subtleties of the French, Belgian and Dutch Cassation Courts*

Chapter 8 <b>Formal and Informal Determinative Factors in the Legitimacy of Judicial Decisions: The Point of View of the French Court of Cassation</b> Guy CANIVET	125
--	-----

Chapter 9		
<b>But Pasteur was French: Comments on Mitchel Lasser's 'The European Pasteurization of French Law'</b>		
Koen LEMMENS	145	
Chapter 10		
<b>Filtering Applications, Number of Judgments Delivered and Judicial Discourse by Supreme Courts: Some Thoughts Based on the French Example</b>		
Andrea PINNA	175	
Chapter 11		
<b>A Commentary on Lasser's Analysis from the Belgian Court of Cassation's Perspective</b>		
Luc HUYBRECHTS	189	
Chapter 12		
<b>Legitimacy and Democracy through Adjudication: Comparative Reflections on the Argumentative Practice of the French and Belgian <i>Cour de cassation</i></b>		
Maurice ADAMS and Fernand TANGHE	197	
Chapter 13		
<b>Judicial Reasoning and Legitimacy of the Dutch Supreme Court</b>		
Willibrord J.M. DAVIDS	223	
Chapter 14		
<b>The Legitimacy of the Decisions of the Dutch Supreme Court in Criminal Cases</b>		
Geert CORSTENS	227	
Chapter 15		
<b>The Perspective of the Annotator: Some Observations About the Organisation and Format of the Judgments and Decisions of the Criminal Division of the Supreme Court of the Netherlands, and the Role of the Annotator</b>		
Paul MEVIS	235	
Chapter 16		
<b>The Perspective of a Cassation Attorney in Criminal Cases</b>		
Rob BAUMGARDT	251	
Chapter 17		
<b>Legitimacy of the Ruling: a Formal Approach</b>		
Carel SMITH	257	
Part III. <i>Challenges to the Legitimacy of Courts</i>		
Chapter 18		
<b>Courts in a Quest for Legitimacy: A Comparative Approach</b>		
Marc A. LOTH	267	

Chapter  
Another  
Light of  
States  
Elaine M

Chapter :  
From Tr  
Rob JAG

Chapter :  
A Comp  
Californ  
E. Grace

Chapter :  
The Dut  
Catalogu  
Kees Lo

Chapter :  
Function  
Siniša R

Chapter :  
Judicial  
Lech GA

Chapter :  
Judicial  
Wilhelmi

Chapter :  
Judicial  
Janneke

Chapter :  
Legitima  
Tom BAE

Chapter :  
Judicial  
Roel DE J

General

Chapter 19	
<b>Another Turn of the Screw: an Evaluation of Lasser's <i>Judicial Deliberations</i> in the Light of the Practices of Constitutional Review in France, Germany and the United States</b>	289
Elaine MAK	
Chapter 20	
<b>From Traditional Judicial Styles to Verdict Industries Inc.</b>	301
Rob JAGTENBERG and Annie DE ROO	
Chapter 21	
<b>A Comparison Between Wrongful Dismissal Cases in The Netherlands and California: A Quest for Transparency of Judicial Decisions</b>	323
E. Grace VAN ARKEL	
Chapter 22	
<b>The Dutch Supreme Court Versus the Lower Courts: Summary Dismissal and the Catalogue of Viewpoints</b>	343
Kees LOONSTRA and Jeroen QUIST	
Chapter 23	
<b>Functions of Judicial Opinion: A View from a Post-Communist European State</b>	369
Siniša RODIN	
 <b>Part IV. <i>The ECtHR and its Peculiar 'Problematic'</i></b>	
Chapter 24	
<b>Judicial Deliberations: The Strasbourg Perspective</b>	389
Lech GARLICKI	
Chapter 25	
<b>Judicial Legitimacy in an Internationalized World</b>	399
Wilhelmina THOMASSEN	
Chapter 26	
<b>Judicial Deliberations in the European Court of Human Rights</b>	407
Janneke GERARDS	
Chapter 27	
<b>Legitimacy of European Court of Human Rights Judgments: Procedural Aspects</b>	437
Tom BARKHUYSEN and Michiel VAN EMMERIK	
Chapter 28	
<b>Judicial Deliberations and Human Rights Adjudication</b>	451
Roel DE LANGE	
<b>General Index</b>	471